

Stream Restoration Crediting for Meeting Sediment and Nutrient Goals in the Chesapeake Bay



CENTER FOR
WATERSHED
PROTECTION

Summary of 6-Month
Test Drive Results

Bill Stack

July 9, 2014



The “Test-Drive” Process

- Recommended protocols are new, somewhat complex and will require project-based interpretation on the part of practitioners and regulators alike.
- Five consulting firms and one local government applied the protocols to ten different projects over the 6-month test drive period.

Main Concerns Identified during the "Test-Drive" Process

- General Concerns

- The protocols are too complicated and difficult to use for planning purposes.
- Suggested using the interim rate for planning
- The interim rate leads to load reductions that can exceed watershed loading rates and may preclude the use of more robust protocols.
- Found mistake for TN and TSS and made corrections

- Protocol 1 Concerns

- The BANCS method may not be accurate and regional curves have not been developed.
- Gave jurisdictions flexibility to use alternative methods
- The 50% efficiency requirement is too low.
- Allowed for higher credit if supported by monitoring
- Confusion over application of the sediment delivery ratio.
- Sediment delivery ratio integrated into interim rate and Protocol 1

Main Concerns Identified during the "Test-Drive" Process

- Protocol 2 Concerns

- Certain types of projects result in load reductions that can exceed watershed loading especially for Protocol 2.
- Load reductions capped so as not exceed 40% of watershed load (from studies)

- Protocol 3 Concerns

- The curves used to develop Protocol 3 are not accurate enough for design purposes.
- Additional curves provided using RCN Method
- The pre-restoration condition was not accounted for
- Credit now based on difference between before and after assessment
- Confusion over how upstream BMPs will affect load to the project and subsequently the credit received.
- Runoff reducing BMPs already accounted for in design.
- Confusion over why the baseflow TN credit from Protocol 2 is not added to the credit from Protocol 3.
- Protocol 2 and 3 can now be additive